

THE MONEY ARGUMENT FOR HOME RULE.

By T. M. KETTLE, M.P.

It is said that the case for Home Rule rests on merely sentimental grounds. The proper word in this connection would not be sentimental, but moral; and from the moral point of view the Home Rule case is unanswerable. **Good government, as Sir Henry Campbell-Bannerman has said, is no substitute for self-government.** But the government of Ireland is not good.

There is a money argument as well as a moral argument for Home Rule. It will be found in the tables at the end of this pamphlet. In 1901 a similar document was prepared and circulated by Mr. Thomas Lough, M.P. The figures are now brought up to date by reference to the annual returns of revenue and expenditure for Great Britain and Ireland. For facility of reference, Revenue is classified under three heads, direct and indirect taxes, and non-tax revenue, and each head is again sub-divided. Details of the two chief indirect taxes are given in a footnote. Expenditure is arranged under six heads. The initial year 1894 is chosen as the date of appointment of the Financial Relations Commission.

The Commission reported that in 1894 Ireland was over-taxed by £2,500,000 annually. **Calculated on this basis the conscience-money due by England to Ireland is more than £400,000,000.**

Since 1894, so far from any amends having been made, things have become very much worse.

The taxation of Ireland has risen by nearly two millions a year.

Her population has fallen by close on 200,000.

The cost of her home government has increased by £2,062,239, or from £1 4s. 6d. to £1 15s. per head of the population.

The drain on her resources has been so deadly that in spite of greatly increased taxation her Imperial contribution is £150,000 per annum less than it was fourteen years ago. This drain has been continuous. In 1859 Ireland paid more than £5,000,000 of the cost of the Army and Navy. She now pays less than £2,000,000.

Ireland is ruined by the present system. The British Empire does not gain by it. The only class that does profit by it is a horde of officials.

Scotland at present has a larger population than Ireland. **But of Government officials assessed for income-tax there are in Scotland 963, in Ireland, 4,539. Their salaries are in Scotland, £311,694 ; in Ireland, £1,412,520.**

Education in Ireland is admitted by all parties to be absolutely starved. The grant for primary education in the present year is in England 7s. 10½d. ; in Ireland, only 6s. 5d. per head of the population. **The grant in England has increased in the last seven years by 43 per cent., in Scotland by 51 per cent., in Ireland by only 1½ per cent.**

Ireland is forced to spend £3 for every £1 spent by Scotland on law and justice, although she has less crime to deal with. The cost of the Law Courts in Scotland was last year £202,608 ; the cost in Ireland, £368,714. **Irish police cost practically £1,500,000, that is to say, more than the whole system of primary education ;** Scotch police cost about £500,000. The Irish Prisons Board, with only 2,500 convicts under its charge, costs £107,000 per annum ; the Scotch Prisons Board, with 2,900 convicts, costs £87,000.

The burden of all this extravagance is borne in Ireland by the poor. **Only 50 per cent.** of revenue is raised in England by indirect taxation ; in Ireland **73 per cent.** is raised by taxes on articles of food

and drink. **Food taxes, i.e., taxes on tea, sugar and other necessities, have increased in Ireland since the year of the Financial Relations Commission by more than 140 per cent.** Food taxes account for 40 per cent. of the increase of taxation from 1894 to 1908. At the same time the average weekly wage of an agricultural labourer is in Scotland, 19s. 3d.; in England, 18s. 3d.; in Ireland, 10s. 11d.

The excessive cost of Irish government can be illustrated in another way. Of her national income of £1,800,000,000 a year, England spends **less than one-fortieth part on her home government.** Of her national income of £70,000,000 a year, Ireland is forced to spend on her home government **more than one-tenth.**

Mr. Gladstone foresaw this deadly and demoralising growth of Irish expenditure, and he realised that there is only one cure for it. In introducing his Home Rule Bill of 1886, he said :—

“The civil charges per capita at this moment are in Great Britain 8s. 2d., and in Ireland 16s. They have increased in Ireland in the last fifteen years by 63 per cent., and my belief is that **if the present legislative and administrative systems be maintained, you must make up your minds to a continual, never ending, and never to be limited augmentation.**”

Mr. Gladstone's forecast was lamentably correct. **The civil charges in Ireland are now not 16s., but 28s. 6d. per capita.**

There is no remedy for these growing evils except Mr. Gladstone's remedy—**HOME RULE**—which alone can give to Ireland the power and the incentive to economise with prudence, and to spend with judgment her own money.

REVENUE.

TABLE showing the Population and Revenue of Ireland from 1893—1894 to 1899—1900 under the three heads of Direct and Indirect Taxes, and Non-Tax Revenue.

	1893—1894.		1894—1895.		1895—1896.		1896—1897.		1897—1898.		1898—1899.		1899—1900.	
	Rate.	Yield. £	Rate.	Yield. £	Rate.	Yield. £	Rate.	Yield. £	Rate.	Yield. £	Rate.	Yield. £	Rate.	Yield. £
DIRECT TAXES:														
Income Tax ..	-7	653,417	-8	664,574	-8	718,001	-8	682,000	-8	687,000	-8	704,000	-8	711,000
Death Duties ..		503,475		503,475		648,413		718,000		642,000		738,000		653,000
Stamps ..		248,600		262,876		272,399		296,000		305,000		301,000		296,000
		1,375,944		1,430,925		1,638,813		1,696,000		1,600,034		1,743,000		1,660,000
INDIRECT TAXES:														
Sugar ..	-4	564,080	-4	583,282	-4	604,204	-4	615,000	-4	627,000	-4	653,000	-4	735,000
Tea, &c.* ..	3/2	1,174,642	3/2	1,194,533	3/2	1,217,431	3/2	1,227,000	2/8	1,263,000	2/8	1,201,000	2/8	1,177,000
Tobacco ..		3,529,053		3,554,975		3,614,348		3,631,000		3,620,000		3,600,000		4,047,000
Alcohol† ..														
Corn... ..		5,267,775		5,205,969		5,435,983		5,473,000		5,510,000		5,454,000		5,959,000
NON-TAX REVENUE:														
Non-Tax ..		134,828		126,485		128,368		132,000		111,500		124,000		133,500
Post Office ..		752,293		763,647		795,168		809,000		824,000		846,000		878,000
Crown Lands ..		37,809		36,498		36,052		36,000		35,000		35,000		34,000
		924,930		926,450		959,588		977,000		970,500		1,005,000		1,045,500
TOTAL OF TAXES ..		7,568,649		7,690,345		8,034,384		8,146,000		8,114,500		8,202,000		8,664,500
POPULATION ..		4,600,599		4,574,764		4,560,378		4,551,723		4,543,782		4,535,516		4,500,764
DETAILS—TEA*														
Cocoa ..		12,309		14,149		14,605		17,000		21,000		22,000		22,000
„		12,494		12,842		12,620		13,000		12,000		12,000		14,000
„		43,775		47,037		46,276		46,000		45,000		43,000		47,000
„		439,033		502,268		524,467		532,000		541,000		564,000		648,000
„		6,469		6,986		6,236		7,000		8,000		12,000		4,000
„		564,080		583,282		604,204		615,000		627,000		653,000		735,000
ALCOHOL†														
Foreign Spirits ..	1/-	368,049	1/-	369,095	1/-	370,209	1/-	386,000	1/-	378,000	1/-	356,000	1/-	414,000
„	10/6	86,811	11/-	91,496	10/6	100,399	10/6	104,000	10/6	106,000	10/6	112,000	10/6	138,000
„	6/3	2,234,684	6/3	2,206,635	6/3	2,224,422	6/3	2,203,000	6/3	2,175,000	6/3	2,151,000	6/3	2,471,000
„		634,278		600,757		720,058		737,000		757,000		773,000		814,000
„		195,231		194,992		199,230		201,000		204,000		208,000		210,000
„														
„		3,529,053		3,554,975		3,614,348		3,631,000		3,620,000		3,600,000		4,047,000

EXPENDITURE.

TABLE showing the Irish Expenditure and the Imperial Contribution from 1893—1894 to 1899—1900, giving details of the principal items.

	1893—1894.	1894—1895.	1895—1896.	1896—1897.	1897—1898.	1898—1899.	1899—1900.
Law and Police ..	£ 2,235,698	£ 2,171,406	£ 2,285,279	£ 2,192,500	£ 2,243,500	£ 2,172,500	£ 2,255,500
Dublin Castle ..	882,438	840,302	916,699	878,500	889,500	890,500	795,500
Education ..	1,141,966	1,165,728	1,220,007	1,356,000	1,275,500	1,288,000	1,293,000
Local Grants ..	569,643	637,364	709,050	720,000	860,000	1,183,000	1,611,000
Post Office ..	792,810	801,561	807,720	823,000	866,000	943,000	1,025,000
Imperial Contribution	1,966,094	2,073,984	2,095,629	2,176,000	1,980,000	1,725,000	1,684,500
Total Expenditure	7,568,649	7,690,345	8,034,384	8,146,000	8,114,500	8,202,000	8,664,500
DETAILS :—							
Pensions ..	17,824	17,610	17,610	19,000	17,000	15,000	16,000
Salary of Judges ..	118,875	118,729	117,566	115,000	115,000	118,500	120,000
Law and Police ..	2,025,439	2,006,247	2,029,213	2,031,000	2,057,000	2,030,000	2,062,500
Class VII.	73,560	28,820	120,890	27,500	54,500	9,000	57,000
	2,235,698	2,171,406	2,285,279	2,192,500	2,243,500	2,172,500	2,255,500
Lord Lieutenant, &c.	21,808	21,804	21,804	22,000	21,500	21,500	22,000
Board of Works, &c.	193,154	164,636	177,059	182,000	173,000	180,000	171,000
L.G.B., &c., Cl. II.	293,828	297,121	306,496	297,500	305,500	305,000	205,000
Surveys ..	50,950	52,100	49,400	49,000	48,000	50,000	64,000
Collection of Taxes ..	220,691	223,440	228,440	232,000	241,000	242,000	242,000
Superannuation, &c. ..	79,300	83,950	83,500	81,000	79,500	80,000	73,500
Board of Agriculture	—	—	50,000	15,000	21,000	12,000	18,000
	862,438	840,302	916,699	878,500	889,500	890,500	795,500
Queen's Colleges ..	21,000	21,000	21,000	21,000	21,000	21,000	21,000
Class IV.	1,120,966	1,144,728	1,199,007	1,240,000	1,254,500	1,267,000	1,272,000
Teachers' Superann. ..	—	—	—	95,000	—	—	—
	1,141,966	1,165,728	1,220,007	1,356,000	1,275,500	1,288,000	1,293,000
Exchequer Grants ..	{ 321,014	323,766	353,940	401,000	511,000	404,000	1,053,000
Contrib.	{ 40,000	40,000	40,900	40,000	40,000	447,000	409,000
	{ 38,247	{ 62,268	78,101	89,000	87,000	92,000	99,000
Railways ..	121,433	123,297	126,206	130,000	137,000	143,000	17,000
Lunatics ..	18,079	17,958	17,817	18,000	18,000	18,000	33,000
Hospitals, &c.	30,870	32,575	42,186	42,000	44,000	42,000	—
Rates on Gov. Prop. ..	—	35,000	50,800	—	23,000	37,000	—
Class VII.—Relief ..	569,643	637,364	709,050	720,000	860,000	1,183,000	1,611,000

REVENUE.

TABLE showing the Population and Revenue of Ireland from 1900—1901 to 1906—1907 under the three heads of Direct and Indirect Taxes, and Non-Tax Revenue.

	1900—1901.		1901—1902.		1902—1903.		1903—1904.		1904—1905.		1905—1906.		1906—1907.	
	Rate.	Yield. £	Rate.	Yield. £	Rate.	Yield. £	Rate.	Yield. £	Rate.	Yield. £	Rate.	Yield. £	Rate.	Yield. £
DIRECT TAXES:														
Income Tax ..	1/-	975,000	1/2	1,176,000	1/3	1,281,000	-/11	1,137,000	1/-	1,115,000		1,085,000		1,102,000
Death Duties ..		873,000		760,000		642,000		762,000		742,000		611,000		691,000
Stamps ..		290,000		316,000		284,000		284,000		288,000		293,000		300,000
		2,138,000		2,252,000		2,207,000		2,183,000		2,145,000		1,989,000		2,093,000
INDIRECT TAXES:														
Sugar ..		—	4/2	688,000	4/2	473,000	4/2	573,000		602,000		602,000		602,000
Tea, &c.* ..	-/6	964,000	-/6	901,000	-/6	926,000	-/6	770,000	-/8	928,000		773,000		642,000
Tobacco ..	3/-	1,366,000	3/-	1,098,000	3/-	1,269,000	3/-	1,272,000		1,310,000		1,313,000		1,291,000
Alcohol† ..		3,985,000		3,773,000		3,946,000		3,810,000		3,616,000		3,577,000		3,646,000
Corn ..		—	1/-	—	1/-	276,000		14,000		—		—		—
		6,315,000		6,460,000		6,890,000		6,439,000		6,456,000		6,265,000		6,181,000
NON-TAX														
REVENUE:														
Non-Tax ..		116,000		116,000		117,500		115,500		120,500		120,500		126,000
Post Office ..		903,000		923,000		960,000		980,000		1,002,000		1,043,000		1,060,000
Crown Lands ..		33,000		33,000		31,000		31,000		30,000		29,500		30,000
		1,052,000		1,072,000		1,108,500		1,126,500		1,152,500		1,193,000		1,216,000
TOTAL OF TAXES		9,505,000		9,784,000		10,205,500		9,748,500		9,753,500		9,447,000		9,490,000
POPULATION ..		4,456,546		4,430,028		4,432,287		4,414,995		4,398,462		4,386,035		—
DETAILS—TEA*														
Cocoa ..		27,000		27,000		24,000		28,000		27,000		27,000		25,000
Coffee, &c. ..		13,000		13,000		13,000		13,000		13,000		13,000		13,000
Fruit ..		33,000		41,000		44,000		47,000		45,000		48,000		47,000
Tea ..	-/6	873,000	-/6	811,000	-/6	837,000	-/6	672,000	-/8	836,000		680,000		552,000
Sundries ..		5,000		9,000		8,000		10,000		7,000		5,000		5,000
		964,000		901,000		926,000		770,000		928,000		773,000		642,000
ALCOHOL†														
Foreign Spirits ..		365,000		349,000		368,000		363,000		343,000		333,000		348,000
Wine ..	1/6	119,000	1/6	116,000	1/6	122,000	1/6	103,000	1/6	90,000		89,000		92,000
Spirits ..	11/-	2,324,000	11/-	2,088,000	11/-	2,194,000	11/-	2,154,000	11/-	2,046,000		1,988,000		1,992,000
Beer ..	7/9	968,000	7/9	1,097,000	7/9	1,048,000	7/9	976,000	7/9	923,000		952,000		996,000
Licences ..		211,000		213,000		214,000		214,000		214,000		214,000		216,000
Other Items ..		—		—		—		—		—		1,000		2,000
		3,985,000		3,773,000		3,946,000		3,810,000		3,616,000		3,577,000		3,646,000

EXPENDITURE.

TABLE showing the Irish Expenditure and the Imperial Contribution from 1900—1901 to 1906—1907, giving details of the principal items.

	1900—1901.	1901—1902.	1902—1903.	1903—1904.	1904—1905.	1905—1906.	1906—1907.
Law and Police	£ 2,247,000	£ 2,207,000	£ 2,212,500	£ 2,229,500	£ 2,159,000	£ 2,168,500	£ 2,239,000
Dublin Castle	932,000	966,000	1,004,500	1,049,500	1,042,000	1,063,000	1,019,500
Education	1,434,500	1,333,000	1,366,000	1,409,500	1,419,500	1,428,000	1,425,000
Local Grants	1,631,000	1,621,000	1,630,000	1,733,500	1,774,500	1,777,000	1,786,000
Post Office	1,061,000	1,087,000	1,140,000	1,126,000	1,172,000	1,199,000	1,209,000
Imperial Contribution	2,199,000	2,570,000	2,852,000	2,200,500	2,186,500	1,811,500	1,811,500
Total Expenditure	9,505,000	9,784,000	10,205,000	9,748,500	9,753,500	9,447,000	9,490,000
DETAILS:—							
Pensions	14,000	11,500	11,000	11,500	13,500	13,500	14,000
Salary of Judges	115,000	115,000	115,000	116,000	110,000	108,000	108,000
Law and Police	2,067,500	2,070,500	2,075,000	2,073,000	2,024,500	2,036,500	2,086,000
Class VII.	51,000	10,000	11,500	29,000	11,000	10,500	31,000
Lord Lieutenant, &c.	2,247,500	2,207,000	2,212,500	2,229,500	2,159,000	2,168,500	2,239,000
Board of Works, &c.	21,000	21,500	21,500	21,500	21,500	21,500	21,500
L.G.B., &c., Cl. II.	179,000	172,000	192,000	192,000	195,000	202,000	169,000
Surveys	334,000	368,000	379,000	409,000	395,000	413,500	410,000
Collection of Taxes	73,000	81,000	83,000	94,000	94,000	92,000	90,000
Superannuation, &c.	244,000	243,000	246,000	243,000	249,000	245,000	243,000
Board of Agriculture	81,000	80,500	83,000	85,000	87,500	89,000	86,000
Queen's Colleges	932,000	966,000	1,004,500	1,049,500	1,042,000	1,063,000	1,019,500
Class IV.	21,000	21,000	21,000	21,000	21,000	21,000	21,000
Teachers' Superann.	1,413,500	1,312,000	1,345,000	1,383,500	1,396,500	1,407,000	1,404,000
Exchequer Grants	1,434,500	1,333,000	1,366,000	1,409,500	1,419,500	1,428,000	1,425,000
Contrib.	{ 1,054,000	1,055,000	{ 1,058,000	{ 1,059,000	1,059,000	1,059,000	{ 1,059,000
Railways	{ 402,000	389,000	385,000	376,000	374,000	386,000	406,500
Imanities	113,000	113,000	124,000	123,000	185,000	185,000	185,000
Hospitals, &c.	18,000	17,500	17,000	17,500	85,000	59,000	63,500
Rates on Gov. Prop.	44,000	46,500	48,000	51,000	17,500	17,000	17,000
Class VII.—Relief	—	—	—	—	54,000	54,000	55,000
Total	1,631,000	1,621,000	1,630,000	1,733,500	1,774,500	1,777,000	1,786,000

Leaflets Issued by the Irish Press Agency.

No. 1.—Canada and Home Rule.

„ 2.—The Record of Irish Local Bodies.

„ 3.—The Manufacture of Crime in Ireland.

„ 4.—The Facts about Crime in Ireland.

„ 5.—The Irish Poor Law and the Blessings of English Government. By Hugh Law, M.P.

„ 6.—Police and Crime in Ireland, England and Wales. A Comparison. By E. Haviland Burke, M.P. (in preparation).

„ 7.—The Irish County Councils. By Z. (in preparation).

„ 8.—The Money Argument for Home Rule. By T. M. Kettle, M.P.